

# Extremal Principle in Variational Analysis

January 9, 2009

## 1 (2.2.1) Approximate Extremal Principle in Smooth Banach Spaces

**Theorem 1** (2.10 approximate extremal principle in Fréchet smooth Banach Spaces)

The approximate extremal principle is valid in any Banach space  $X$  with Fréchet differentiable norm.

**Proof.** We suppose that  $\{\Omega_1, \Omega_2, \dots, \Omega_n; \bar{x}\}$  is an extremal system in  $X$ . Let  $\Omega = \Omega_2 \times \Omega_3 \times \dots \times \Omega_n$ . Vectors  $(x, u) \in \Omega_1 \times \Omega$  will be denoted by  $z$  and  $x_D$  will denote the  $(n-1)$ -tuple  $(x, x, \dots, x)$ . Assume  $0 < \varepsilon < \frac{1}{2}$ . Choose  $a \in \frac{\varepsilon^3}{16} \mathbf{B}^{n-1}$  such that

$$x_D + a \notin \Omega \quad \forall x \in \Omega_1$$

Let  $\varepsilon_k \searrow 0$  such that  $\varepsilon_1 = \frac{\varepsilon^3}{16}$  and  $\varepsilon_{k-2} \geq \varepsilon_{k-1} + \varepsilon_k$  (a particular choice of  $\varepsilon_k$  will be made later). Recursively define the sequences  $\{\varphi_k\}_{k=0}^\infty, \{W_k\}_{k=0}^\infty, \{z_k\}_{k=1}^\infty$  as follows:

For  $k = 0$ ;

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi_0(z) & : = \|x_D - u + a\|, \quad z \in \Omega_1 \times \Omega, \\ W_0 & = \Omega_1 \times \Omega, \end{aligned}$$

where the norm in  $X^n$  is defined as  $\|z\| = \sqrt{\|x\|^2 + \|u_2\|^2 + \|u_3\|^2 + \dots + \|u_n\|^2}$ .

Set

$$z_1 = (\bar{x}, \bar{x}_D).$$

For  $k = 1, 2, \dots$ ;

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi_k(z) & : = \varphi_{k-1}(z) + \frac{\varepsilon}{2^k} \|z - z_k\|^2, \\ W_k & = \{z \in \Omega_1 \times \Omega : \varphi_k(z) \leq \varphi_{k-1}(z_k) + \varepsilon_k\} \end{aligned}$$

and choose  $z_{k+1} \in W_k$  such that

$$\varphi_k(z_{k+1}) < \inf_{W_k} \varphi_k(z) + \varepsilon_k$$

- $z_1 \in W_1$  and  $\text{diam } W_1 < \varepsilon$ : For the first part,

$$\varphi_1(z_1) = \varphi_0(z_1) + \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \|z_1 - z_1\|^2 < \varphi_0(z_1) + \varepsilon_1.$$

For the second part, let  $z \in W_1$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi_1(z) &\leq \varphi_0(z_1) + \varepsilon_1 = \|a\| + \frac{\varepsilon^3}{16} < \frac{\varepsilon^3}{8}; \\ \varphi_0(z) + \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \|z - z_1\|^2 &< \frac{\varepsilon^3}{8}; \\ \|z - z_1\|^2 &< \frac{\varepsilon^2}{4}. \end{aligned}$$

- $\{W_k\}_{k=0}^\infty$  is a decreasing sequence: Let  $z \in W_k$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi_k(z) &\leq \varphi_{k-1}(z_k) + \varepsilon_k < \varphi_{k-1}(u) + (\varepsilon_{k-1} + \varepsilon_k) \forall u \in W_{k-2} \\ &= \varphi_{k-2}(u) + \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{k-1}} \|u - z_{k-1}\|^2 + (\varepsilon_{k-1} + \varepsilon_k). \end{aligned}$$

Since  $z_{k-1} \in W_{k-2}$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi_k(z) &< \varphi_{k-2}(z_{k-1}) + (\varepsilon_{k-1} + \varepsilon_k) \\ &\leq \varphi_{k-2}(z_{k-1}) + \varepsilon_{k-2}. \end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$\varphi_{k-1}(z) + \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{k-1}} \|z - z_k\|^2 \leq \varphi_{k-2}(z_{k-1}) + \varepsilon_{k-2}$$

which gives

$$\varphi_{k-1}(z) \leq \varphi_{k-2}(z_{k-1}) + \varepsilon_{k-2}$$

and  $z \in W_{k-1}$ .

- $\text{diam } W_k \rightarrow 0$ : Let  $z \in W_k$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi_k(z) &\leq \varphi_{k-1}(z_k) + \varepsilon_k \\ \varphi_{k-1}(z) + \frac{\varepsilon}{2^{k-1}} \|z - z_k\|^2 &\leq \varphi_{k-1}(z_k) + \varepsilon_k \leq \varphi_{k-1}(z) + (\varepsilon_{k-1} + \varepsilon_k) \\ \|z - z_k\|^2 &\leq \frac{2^{k-1}(\varepsilon_{k-1} + \varepsilon_k)}{\varepsilon}. \end{aligned}$$

If we choose

$$\varepsilon_k = \frac{\varepsilon_1}{2^{2k+1}}, \quad k > 1$$

then  $\|z - z_k\| \rightarrow 0$  as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ .

- $\bigcap W_k = \{\bar{z}\}$ : This follows immediately from the completeness of  $X$ .

Define the function  $\varphi : \Omega_1 \times \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  by

$$\varphi(z) = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} \varphi_k(z) = \varphi_0(z) + \varepsilon \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{\|z - z_k\|^2}{2^k}$$

•  $\bar{z}$  is a minimizer of  $\varphi$  over  $\Omega_1 \times \Omega$ :

– We show first that  $\varphi_k(z_{k+1}) \rightarrow \varphi(\bar{z})$ :

$$\begin{aligned} |\varphi_k(z_{k+1}) - \varphi_k(\bar{z})| &\leq |\varphi_0(z_{k+1}) - \varphi_0(\bar{z})| + \varepsilon \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{|\|z_{k+1} - z_j\|^2 - \|\bar{z} - z_j\|^2|}{2^j} \\ &= |\varphi_0(z_{k+1}) - \varphi_0(\bar{z})| \\ &\quad + \varepsilon \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{(|\|z_{k+1} - z_j\| - \|\bar{z} - z_j\||)(\|z_{k+1} - z_j\| + \|\bar{z} - z_j\|)}{2^j} \\ &\leq |\varphi_0(z_{k+1}) - \varphi_0(\bar{z})| + \varepsilon \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{2\delta_j \|z_{k+1} - \bar{z}\|}{2^j} \\ &\leq |\varphi_0(z_{k+1}) - \varphi_0(\bar{z})| + M\varepsilon \|z_{k+1} - \bar{z}\|, \end{aligned}$$

where

$$M = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{\delta_j}{2^{j-1}}$$

and

$$\delta_j = \text{diam } W_j.$$

Since  $z_{k+1} \rightarrow \bar{z}$  and  $\varphi_0$  is continuous,  $|\varphi_k(z_{k+1}) - \varphi_k(\bar{z})| \rightarrow 0$  as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ .

Now

$$|\varphi_k(z_{k+1}) - \varphi(\bar{z})| \leq |\varphi_k(z_{k+1}) - \varphi_k(\bar{z})| + |\varphi_k(\bar{z}) - \varphi(\bar{z})| \rightarrow 0 \text{ as } k \rightarrow \infty.$$

– Next, we show that  $\varphi(z) \geq \varphi(\bar{z})$  for all  $z \in X \times \Omega$ : For  $z \in X \times \Omega$ , and  $z \neq \bar{z}$ ,  $z \notin W_k$  for all  $k$  sufficiently large. Then

$$\varphi_{k+1}(z) > \varphi_k(z_{k+1}) + \varepsilon_k.$$

Taking the limit as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ ,

$$\varphi(z) \geq \varphi(\bar{z}).$$

It follows that the function

$$\psi(z) := \varphi(z) + \delta(z; \Omega_1 \times \Omega)$$

achieves a minimum over  $X^n$  at  $\bar{z}$ . Thus

$$0 \in \widehat{\partial}\psi(\bar{z}) = \varphi'(\bar{z}) + \widehat{\partial}\delta(\bar{z}; \Omega_1 \times \Omega)$$

(recall that  $\varphi(z)$  is differentiable at  $\bar{z}$  since  $\varphi(\bar{z}) > 0$ ).

$$\begin{aligned} -\varphi'(\bar{z}) &\in \widehat{N}(\bar{z}; \Omega_1 \times \Omega) = \widehat{N}(\tilde{x}; \Omega_1) \times \widehat{N}(\tilde{u}; \Omega) \\ &= \widehat{N}(\tilde{x}; \Omega_1) \times \prod_{i=2}^n \widehat{N}(\tilde{u}_i; \Omega_i), \end{aligned}$$

where we put  $\bar{z} = (\tilde{x}, \tilde{u})$ . Thus

$$\frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}} \in \widehat{N}(\tilde{x}; \Omega_1), \quad \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \Big|_{\bar{z}} \in \widehat{N}(\tilde{u}; \Omega).$$

Now

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}} &= \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}} + \varepsilon \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{\|\tilde{x} - x_k\|}{2^{j-1}} D(\tilde{x} - x_k), \\ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u_i} \Big|_{\bar{z}} &= \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}} + \varepsilon \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{\|\tilde{u}_i - u_{ik}\|}{2^{j-1}} D(\tilde{u}_i - u_{ik}), \quad 2 \leq i \leq n, \end{aligned}$$

where  $D(\cdot)$  denotes the derivative of the norm in  $X$ . Since  $\|\bar{z} - z_k\| \leq \text{diam } W_k \leq \text{diam } W_1 < \varepsilon$ ,  $\varepsilon < 1/2$  and  $\|D(\cdot)\| = 1$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \varepsilon \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{\|\tilde{x}_i - x_k\|}{2^{j-1}} D(\tilde{u}_i - u_{ik}) &\leq 2\varepsilon^2 < \varepsilon \\ \varepsilon \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{\|\tilde{u}_i - u_{ik}\|}{2^{j-1}} D(\tilde{u}_i - u_{ik}) &\leq 2\varepsilon^2 < \varepsilon, \quad 2 \leq i \leq n. \end{aligned}$$

We proceed by computing  $\frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}}, \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial u} \Big|_{\bar{z}}$ . Since

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi_0(\bar{z}) &= \|\tilde{x} - \tilde{u} + a\| = \sqrt{\sum_{i=2}^n \|\tilde{x} - \tilde{u}_i + a_i\|^2}, \\ \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}} &= \frac{\sum_{i=2}^n \|\tilde{x} - \tilde{u}_i + a_i\| D(\tilde{x} - \tilde{u}_i + a_i)}{\|\tilde{x} - \tilde{u} + a\|} \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial u} \Big|_{\bar{z}} = \left( -\frac{\|\tilde{x} - \tilde{u}_j + a_j\| D(\tilde{x} - \tilde{u}_j + a_j)}{\|\tilde{x} - \tilde{u} + a\|} \right)_{j=2}^n.$$

Clearly

$$\frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}} + \sum_{i=2}^n \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial u_i} \Big|_{\bar{z}} = 0$$

and

$$\sum_{i=2}^n \left\| \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial u_i} \Big|_{\bar{z}} \right\|^2 = 1.$$

Thus the functionals

$$x_1^* = \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial x} \Big|_{\bar{z}}, x_i^* = \frac{\partial \varphi_0}{\partial u_j} \Big|_{\bar{z}}, 2 \leq i \leq n$$

satisfy all the conditions in the approximate variational principle. ■